International Fellows' Pre-Conference Workshop

FOR A GENERATIONAL SHIFT IN ANALYSING CIRCULATING KNOWLEDGE

International Fellows' Pre-Conference Workshop
FOR A GENERATIONAL SHIFT IN ANALYSING CIRCULATING KNOWLEDGE

Wednesday – Sept. 26th

08.30-9.00
Welcome

9.00-10.30

Wahdan, Dalia (Foundation for Liberal and Management Education, Pune, India):
"Quest for DawlaMadania (Civic State): Visions of a New Egyptian Statehood."

Yeranosyan, Meri
N.N.

Kokdas, Irfan (History Department, Binghamton University, State University of New York, USA):
"*The Articulation of Scientific and Religious Knowledge in the Salonikan Political Domain during the Eighteenth Century."*

10.30-11.00
Break

11.00-12.30

Witjes, Nina (InstitutfürInternationaleEntwicklung, University of Vienna, Austria):
"Knowledge for Development: what´s wrong with this?"

Lanzano, Cristiano (DipartimentoInterateneoTerritorio, UniversitàdegliStudi di Torino, Italy):
"What kind of knowledge is indigenous knowledge? Environment, development and 'local knowledge' practices in Burkina Faso."

Busingye, Janice (Institute of Adult & Continuing Education, Makerere University, Kampala, Uganda):
"European social science research as a model for African social science research. The position of the global south."

12.30-14.00

Lunch at the Mensa Rempartsraße

14.00-15.30

Meckesheimer, Anika (Universidad AutónomaMetropolitana, Mexico City):
"Vicissitudes of Constructing Knowledge with, and not only about SocialActors."

Khittel, Stefan (Austrian Institute for International Affairs (OIIP), Vienna, Austria):
"The Modernity/Coloniality Turn in Colombian Social Sciences: Implications for Activism from the Academic Field."

Klein, Stefan (Universidade de Brasilia,UnB, Brazil):
„Introductory remarks on the sociological knowledge in the critical theory of Max Horkheimer."

15.30-16.00

Break

16.00-17.30

Rodríguez Medina, Leandro (Department of International Relations and Political Science, School of Social Sciences, Universidad de las Americas Puebla, Mexico):
"Designing curriculum, displacing knowledge: A postcolonial technoscientific approach to circulation of theories – Part I: Chile."

Schnitzer, Anna(Institut für Erzeihungswissenschaften, Universität Zürich, Schweiz):
"Multilingualismas "The Norm"? First Impressions from the IndianDiscourse."

Tumur, Tuvshee(French National Institute of Oriental Civilizations, Paris):
"Cultural Encounters and Diplomacy in the Mongol Empire period."

17:30-17:45

Break

17:45-18:15

Information on the World-Café (part of the Conference,Thursday Sept. 27)

18:15

Closure of the Workshop

PARTICIPANTS of the International Fellows' Workshop

Participant	Institution	Title of Presentation
Busingye, Janice	Institute of Adult & Continuing Education, Makerere University, Kampala, Uganda	*"European social science research as a model for African social science research. The position of the global south."*
Khittel, Stefan	Austrian Institute for International Affairs (OIIP), Vienna, Austria	*"The Modernity/Coloniality Turn in Colombian Social Sciences: Implications for Activism from the Academic Field."*
Klein, Stefan	Universidade de Brasilia (UnB), Brazil	*"Introductory remarks on the sociological knowledge in the critical theory of Max Horkheimer."*
Kokdas, Irfan	History Department, Binghamton University, State University of New York, USA	*"The Articulation of Scientific and Religious Knowledge in the Salonikan Political Domain during the Eighteenth Century."*
Lanzano, Cristiano	Dipartimento Interateneo Territorio, Universita degli Studi di Torino, Italy	*"What kind of knowledge is indigenous knowledge? Environment, development and 'local knowledge' practices in Burkina Faso."*
Meckesheimer, Anika	Universidad Autónoma Metropolitana, Mexico City	*"Vicissitudes of Constructing Knowledge with, and not only about Social Actors."*
Rodríguez Medina, Leandro	Department of International Relations and Political Science, School of Social Sciences, Universidad de las Americas Puebla, Mexico	*"Designing curriculum, displacing knowledge: A postcolonial technoscientific approach to circulation of theories – Part I: Chile."*
Schnitzer, Anna	Institut für Erziehungswissenschaften, Universität Zürich, Schweiz	*"Multilingualism as 'The Norm'? First Impressions from the IndianDiscourse."*
Tumur, Tuvshee	French National Institute of Oriental Civilizations, Paris	*"Cultural Encounters and Diplomacy in the Mongol Empire period."*
Wahdan, Dalia	Foundation for Liberal and Management Education (FLAME), Pune, India	*"Quest for DawlaMadania (Civic State): Visions of a New Egyptian Statehood."*
Witjes, Nina	Institut für Internationale Entwicklung, University of Vienna, Austria	*"Knowledge for Development: what´s wrong with this?"*
Yeranosyan, Meri		*"..."*

ABSTRACTS for the International Fellows' Workshop

Dalia WAHDAN
Sept. 26, 09.00

Quest for DawlaMadania (Civic State): Visions of a New Egyptian Statehood

On 25 January 2011, Egyptians took to the streets demanding the deposition of the ruling regime and the departure of the former president Hosni Mubarak. Having raised the national flag and repeated nationalist slogans, the uprising has been argued as non-religious. Nevertheless, both religious and secular ideological forces have mingled under the common banner of change, dignity and justice. The success of the popular uprising to depose the regime left Egypt in a state of transition and exposed political and ideological vectors that have been oppressed under the protracted state of emergency, which was declared upon the assassination of Anwar Sadat and the ascendance of Mubarak to power in 1981.

The Muslim Brotherhood, banned under Mubarak, has since reemerged as a potentially powerful candidate for the future ruling regime. Several 'Islamist' movements conjured across the intellectual scene, surprising many self-identified secular Egyptians. Vectors of leftism and liberalism have also revived and are thrusting into political action and forcefully shaping the nascent vision of a New Egyptian State.

In the immediate aftermath of the uprising and a subsequent referendum on constitutional amendments, many spots across the country witnessed violent clashes between Coptic-Christians and Muslims- the two main religious ethnicities. The clashes came to be interpreted as slight examples of how things could turn out if Egypt is to emerge into an Islamist state. The importance of those clashes notwithstanding, they came as warning against an explicitly religious discourse on the future state in Egypt. Conversely, similar anxieties have grown over the alleged immoral horrors expected of having a secular state that separates religion from politics; and skepticism is growing among intellectuals around the existence of historical instances of an Islamic state and/or a pure secular state.

While Muslim Brotherhood maneuvers its way through the political scene, cautious in articulating its vision for the future Egyptian state - there seems

to be a consensus that a 'civic' state is less bellicose than a 'secular' or a 'religious' one, even though the meanings that these constructs imply remain obscure amidst this palpable conceptual conundrum. The importance of deciphering those constructs is indubitable not only for the practical purpose of constructing a clearer vision of the future state in Egypt but also for revealing how intellectual traditions are revised, adapted, indigenized and altered across history and geography. This study proposes to investigate visions of statehood that are presented by the Muslim Brotherhood and the major post-Islamist movements and to juxtapose them to the visions presented by the major leftist vectors in post-uprising Egypt. It attempts to provide answers to the following empirical and theoretical questions: What do various political vectors mean by a 'civic' and a 'secular' state? To what extent do Western and/or European models shape those meanings and visions? To what extent do 'Islamist' strands of statehood figure out in those meanings and visions? What does this tell us about the nature of the process of 'indigenization' of both Western and Non-western theories of state?

This study presumes that visions of the future state in Egypt are shaped – simultaneously - by Western/European theories of Modern state, by non-western social science perspectives, and by the models presented by the existing states that uphold Islamic jurisprudence as the basis of legitimacy in a global neoliberal world. At the same time, when put into practice, those visions get refracted by contemporary dynamics of change and practices of statehood. It is within this nexus that the present study proposes to analyze the meanings of civic and secular and the processes of indigenization of theoretical and historical visions.

Meri YERANOSYAN Sept. 26, 09.30

N.N.

…

Irfan KOKDAS

The Articulation of Scientific and Religious Knowledge in the Salonikan Political Domain during the Eighteenth Century

As an attempt to examine the changing relationship between the scientific and theological polemics on the one hand and the *new* socio-political ideals on the other, this study analyzes how the multi-layered metamorphosis of communal (sub)structures in Ottoman Salonika throughout the eighteenth century shaped the new contours of political and religious imaginations, colored by the jagged debates over the re-articulation of the new political boundaries, the role of science/education in the revitalization of a true faith, the integration of precarious Albanians into a well-defined belief system. Based on the transmuted rhetorics of the Ottoman authorities and writings of the so-called Greek Enlightenment thinkers, the Kollyvades leaders [Nikodimos, Makarios, etc.] and a local Ottoman poet [HasanAkif], this project specifically revolves around two intertwined questions: (a) how the scientific vocabulary and interpretations particularly from the 1750s onwards were transmitted, reproduced and transformed in the Salonikan cultural sphere; and (b) to what extent local thinkers and power holders (Muslim and Christian alike) in the region used these ideas and polemics in the production of the "alternative" political visions as to control the extensive peasant mobility and the political claims of newly rising social groups.

In tandem with the rising interest of several itinerant Ottoman scholars in the pharmacology, geography, linguistics and philosophy, the multiple agendas of these *new* social groups and the synchronous controversies surrounding the ideological meanings of people [ahali or reaya] became embedded more and more into the contemporary scientific or rhetorical texts. As these debates came to involve discussions of "virtuous Muslim and Christian," of definition of the legitimate political behaviours, both jargons and concomitant scientific terminology did not remain merely in the language of science or theology, but gradually evolved into a language of public discourses about the erosion of moral order, exclusion from a Muslim or Christian community, and more importantly, the new meanings of religious/political practices. Scrutinizing the multiplication of these meanings will not only shed light on the eighteenth-century changes in scientific-

theological vocabulary, but also makes it possible to consider the Ottoman Balkans at the crossroads of two distinct problematiques: (1) the nature and semiotics of early modernity(ies) with its(their) ruptures and continuities in the eighteenth-century Balkans, and (2) the relationship between changing forms of political hegemony and the production of knowledge in an Ottoman provincial setting.

Nina WITJES   Sept. 26, 11.00

Knowledge for Development: what´s wrong with this?

The presentation aims at examining the 'knowledge for development' paradigm, which has become an umbrella concept in international development cooperation, in terms of its underlying concepts and its effects on North-South knowledge asymmetries. It will try to give answer to the following question: is the K4D paradigm just a hegemonic imaginary which, as a highly influential umbrella concept in international development cooperation, helps to marginalise alternative imaginaries?   Is the K4D-paradigm just another tool to consolidate social and political consensus on existing societal patterns?

To do so, some of the biggest Knowledge Management initiatives in development cooperation will be analysed, applying approaches rooted in critical sociology of knowledge and education and postcolonial sociology and cultural political economy. It will be argued that at least some of them assert existing knowledge hierarchies and are therefore of limited "developmental value".

Cristiano LANZANO   Sept. 26, 11.30

What kind of knowledge is indigenous knowledge? Environment, development and 'local knowledge' practices in Burkina Faso.

My intervention draws both from ethnographic material on conservation in Burkina Faso and from broader epistemological reflections on some concepts nowadays widespread in the development and conservation discourses on (and in) the global South. I conducted ethnographic research

on protected areas in Burkina Faso: I focused particularly on 'participatory' processes enacted in some cases, and on how the participatory discourse became intertwined with that of the reassessment and promotion of 'local knowledge' and 'traditional practices' toward the environment. In the forest of Comoé-Léraba (Western Burkina Faso, bordering Cote d'Ivoire), some cultural practices (especially the role of *donso* or traditional Mande hunters, and the presence of sacred groves and forest shrines) have received attention and have been variously included in the activities of the inter-village association managing the area (conception of a museum, cultural tourism packages, etc.).

I will first describe and discuss some findings on sacred places among the Komono (a group residing in the eastern periphery of the forest), their characteristics and the way they have been considered by forest managers. I will concentrate particularly on the paradoxes of promoting 'local knowledge' and traditional environment-related practices while keeping in mainstream environmental policies. Finally, I will try some generalizations in order to propose a research agenda, both at a theoretical level and at an ethnographic one: how do previous theories on cultural difference and knowledge - e.g., in cultural anthropology, ethnoscience or the reflection on mind, reason and primitiveness - have influenced current conceptualizations of 'indigenous knowledge'? How do the controversial notion of 'indigeneity' or the (slightly less controversial) notions of 'tradition' and 'locality' converge to build a pole opposed to Western scientific knowledge? What are the practical results in those sectors where this reflection has an applied dimension (development aid, environmental conservation)? What are the priorities - in terms of themes and terrains - of an ethnographically informed research on these concepts?

Janice BUSINGYE   Sept. 26, 12.00

European social science research as a model for African social science research.
The position of the global south

In Africa, the Eurocentric epistemology is still predominant in the conceptualisation and production of knowledge. Some authors have attributed this dominance to the claim to universality of the knowledge produced in the North (Popketwitz&Fendler, 1999).

This paper presents findings from a research project under the "BMBF" project, as an international fellow. The purpose of the research project was to find out how research models from the global North have influenced how social science research has been conducted in the global south. The study was conducted in two countries, Uganda and Germany. The first part of the research was conducted in Germany and Germany in an intensive literature review. In Uganda, research employed qualitative methodology to collect date, specifically, key informant interviews for purposively selected Ugandan scholars in the social sciences, who have engaged in post graduate programmes in Germany.

Basing on the Habermas' theory on how knowledge and interests are intertwined (Habermas, 1973), the study revealed that the Ugandan social science research has been modelled on models from the global North. However, some scholars also revealed that partly, the absence of indigenous social science research models specific to Africa has hindered the adoption of any such models. The paper recommends that scholars from Africa should be encouraged to study and develop research models that are relevant to the African context, engaging with African interests.

Anika MECKESHEIMER   Sept. 26, 14.00

Vicissitudes of Constructing Knowledge with, and not only about Social Actors

As a contribution influenced by the perspective of Social Psychology of Groups and Institutions at the Universidad AutónomaMetropolitana – Xochimilco in Mexico City, my paper focuses on the relation between the researcher and the social actors with whom social research is being carried out. On the background of the long history of socially committed research in

Latin America I will highlight two approaches: to do research *with*, and not only *about* social actors (Mato 2000) and to conceive research as activity *by* and *for* social movements (p.ex. Verger y Planells 2002). These stances have implications on the conception of the framework of research projects. It is commonly thought that in academic research on social actors the researcher is expected to outline a timeframe and hypothesis, which will later on be confirmed in fieldwork. Conceiving a research project *with* social actors implies a destabilization of the epistemological center: research objectives and topics, timeframe, and methodological choices are proposed from two different standpoints and have to be negotiated during a research process in which both researcher and actors subjects of knowledge production.

Daniel Mato (2000) observed that under the hegemonic imperatives of academic research methodology, this leads to conflicts regarding timeframe, objectives and methodology, which often make it highly difficult to carry out research projects with social actors. Mato thus proposes to analyze the hegemonic articulations of power in research settings in order to find out how these can be transformed.

Similarly, my analysis focuses on the institutional framework of the academic institution, specifically the institutional situation of postgraduate students as a standpoint from which research is conceived. Methodologically, I draw on the literature of French Institutional Analysis, a movement which arose in the context of 1968 in France, which transferred the working hypothesis of psychoanalysis to the analysis of social institutions. Independent of its development in France, Institutional Analysis is currently taught in the Universidad AutónomaMetropolitana – Xochimilco in Mexico. In order to analyze my own working process with a women's movement within a religious movement related to liberation theology in Chiapas, Mexico, I combine Institutional Analysis with analytical instruments from contemporary feminist debate on the decolonialization of academic practice in Latin America and internationally.

This research instruments work as a dispositive in the sense of a "machine to make people see and speak" (Deleuze 1988) and allow to focus on the claims of several Latin American indigenous women's movements who

have come to criticize extractive practices in social research, and demand an attitude of solidarity and companionship, respect for their movements' agenda in timeframe and objectives, and adequate communication of the results of the research projects they are part of, in a form and language which is accessible to the people who belong to the social movement. I will discuss the friction of these demands with constraints of hegemonic research practice and institutional demands on postgraduate students.

Stefan KHITTEL   Sept. 26, 14.30

The Modernity/Coloniality Turn in Colombian Social Sciences:Implications for Activism from the Academic Field

At least since Michel Foucault ruptures, breaks, turns, changes of paradigm (Thomas Kuhn's term) have been taken centre-stage in epistemological explorations in (social) sciences. Whereas the internal processes of the disciplines have been elucidated by many authors and by various approaches, the effects of such fault lines within the social sciences on social formations have not been followed closely. My paper is an attempt to study a specific case of what I denominate a "turn" in social sciences in Colombia and its effects on politics in general, the ongoing violent conflict and, more specifically, ethnic groups.

First, I shall elaborate on the turn in social sciences that happened around the late 1990s until the first years of the new millennium. My contentions are that what I call the "modernity/coloniality turn" (a) debilitated the already weakened disciplinary borders lastingly, (b) together with reforms of the academic sector (by new university policies) created new and different outlets for publishing, novel forms of postgraduate teaching and generated alternative forms of transdiciplinary research and (c) completely restructured (not started nor generated!) the form of activism by anthropological, sociological, geographical researchers.

In order to achieve the above mentioned tasks I shall start to describe the turn itself and how it altered the way social sciences are enacted in the academic field. Then I shall move on to detail interventions by specific academics (e.g. Arturo Escobar) and how their interventions from the

academic field – and their effects –have changed from before to after the turn.

Stefan KLEIN   Sept. 26, 15.00

Introductory remarks on the sociological knowledge in the critical theory of Max Horkheimer

This presentation aims to point out the academic-intellectual understanding of sociology inside the critical theory of Max Horkheimer. In this sense the paper tries to underline the epistemological perspective of the author as heterodox in different ways: on the one side facing the theoretical influence of Karl Marx and on the other in a critical dialogue with the sociological standpoints of the beginning of the XXth century that started to mold sociology as a more or less autonomous discipline. Therefore it is possible to identify this self-understanding of his theoretical constitution in changing patterns as, for example, with the comparison of the essays from the 1930s to the speeches of the 1950s and highlight the different conceptions (although my focus will be more on the first ones). Relying on this conception I intend to conclude with a brief overview of the reception of his critical theory in the Brazilian academic context.

Leandro RODRÍGUEZ MEDINA   Sept. 26, 16.00

Designing curriculum, displacing knowledge: A postcolonial technoscientific approach to circulation of theories – Part I: Chile

Although curriculum design, knowledge production and international circulation of ideas are topics widely analyzed in STS, the intertwined relationships between them in specific cases have hardly been studied. This research focuses on the reception of NiklasLuhmann's theory in Chile in a comparative perspective. However, unlike reception studies, this paper uses a postcolonial technoscientific approach according to which (1) the reception acknowledges and somehow reproduces a global structure of centers and peripheries; (2) the reception is a process with textual and non-textual (material) dimensions, both of them affecting the receiving field; and (3) reception is a process that shapes the local field (e.g. curriculum design)

by displacing local knowledge to a secondary role. By focusing on reception of foreign theories we can observe the entangled relationship between teaching, research and the organization of peripheral academic fields.

In order to show how foreign knowledge has affected curriculum design and peripheral knowledge production, the reception of Luhmann's theory will be studied through in-depth interviews with scholars in Chile who were responsible of translating Luhmann's works and organizing conferences and journals' special issues about the German sociologist. Those interviews will help us observe the material dimension of reception as well as framing this theoretical contribution in relation to local social and political theories. Interviews will be complemented by textual analysis of Luhmann's theory of society, trying to identify its pertinence to understand Latin American societies.

Anna SCHNITZER   Sept. 26, 16.30

Multilingualism as "The Norm"?First Impressions from the Indian Discourse

Whenever (though not often) the criticism is made that multilingualism is presented and discussed in academic, political and everyday discourse as something dangerous, it is argued that children in many parts of the world naturally grow up multilingual, and that this is only an exception in our "monolingual" central European nation states. The lecture will be asking about the nature of research discourse and praxis in multilingualism in a country of the 'global south' that is not monolingually structured like the majority of European nation states. Central to this lecture are the praxis and discourse of multilingualism in India. The discussion of multilingualism in India will be examined in order to find out what this propagated "normality" consists in, and how it is reflected in the theory. The aim is to gain some initial insight into the subject.

After a short introduction to the linguistic landscape of India, I will identify two lines of discourse in Indian sociolinguistic research by means of two protagonists in the debate. As the next step, I would like to share the initial results of a systematic survey of 11 volumes of the *Indian Journal of*

Applied Linguistics, and then in the conclusion I will briefly discuss the relationship to the linguistic landscape of Switzerland.

TuvsheeTUMUR   Sept. 26, 17.00

Cultural Encounters and Diplomacy in the Mongol Empire period

The aim of the research project is to study, among other relevant documents, the diplomatic letters of the Mongol empire survived so far and the European travel accounts, especially those written by the French kings' and Popes' envoys to the Mongol Empire in the XIII century: besides learning the events, facts and practices that they evidence, to analyze/evaluate some interpretations contained in those literature in light of the cultural knowledge, contemporary achievement in knowledge, methodology and self-assessment of the social science and humanities' scholars at the international level, as well as the results of interdisciplinary studies that I carried out previously.

Thus, on the one hand, I will analyze the political and diplomatic relations and communications, on the other hand, the cultural encounters and communication between, for instance, those envoys and different individuals they met in the Mongol empire.

In general, important societal and culture-related facts and events of the Mongol empire period have not been studied, thus had not been known or ignored during centuries. In particular, the culture of this people has not been well studied abroad, given the lack of knowledge of the Mongol language and literature, as well as the fact that an enormous number of documents concerning the Mongol empire were destroyed and disappeared during the fall of and after that empire (about at least 67,000 documents).

Thus, the research work also concerns the problems and difficulties that social science disciplines, including the discipline of history had, in Europe, in particular, during the last centuries, as well as the analysis of non-academic historical interpretations of the "other", thus the problems of understanding and interpretation of other peoples and cultures, and what had been these historical misunderstandings and misinterpretations, etc.

It also aims at analyzing the relationship between the intercultural communication concern and diplomatic practices of the Mongols in the XIII and XIV centuries, and the intellectual/cultural background underlying such institutions and practices.

The information sources for the research thus include: the above-mentioned travel accounts, especially the travel account written by the French king's envoy Guillaume de Rubrouck; the diplomatic letters of the Mongol emperors and khans sent to the European kings and Popes of that time; relatively recent (thus better) works by some European, and other, historians; historical and literary documents from Mongolia; some documents of a Danish-Sweden Expedition in the 1930s, etc.

German scholar W. Heissig had noted the influence of the diplomatic practices institutions introduced by the Mongols during the XIII century, showing that the diplomatic correspondence between the dynasties that succeeded the Mongol Yuan dynasty in China and the West, had been written in the Mongolian language and script even after the fall of that empire (he cited a XV century evidence). Hence we can see the examples of enduring institutions and practices, including practices in international relations. Another example of relatively recent research concerning this theme is the article of Donald Ostrowsky *"The Mongol Origin of Muscovite Political Institutions"*.